

## Council

You are hereby summoned to attend a Meeting of the **Council of the City and County of Swansea** to be held in the Council Chamber - Guildhall, Swansea on Thursday, 23 January 2020 at 5.00 pm.

The following business is proposed to be transacted:

1. **Apologies for Absence.**
2. **Disclosures of Personal and Prejudicial Interests.**  
[www.swansea.gov.uk/disclosuresofinterests](http://www.swansea.gov.uk/disclosuresofinterests)
3. **Minutes.** **1 - 10**  
To approve & sign the Minutes of the previous meeting(s) as a correct record.
4. **Written Responses to Questions asked at the Last Ordinary Meeting of Council.** **11 - 15**
5. **Announcements of the Presiding Member.**
6. **Announcements of the Leader of the Council.**
7. **Public Questions.**  
Questions must relate to matters on the open part of the Agenda of the meeting and will be dealt with in a 10 minute period.
8. **Presentation - None.**
9. **Adoption of The Council Tax Reduction Scheme.** **16 - 24**
10. **Membership of Committees.** **25 - 26**
11. **Councillors' Questions.** **27 - 61**

**Webcasting:** This meeting may be filmed for live or subsequent broadcast via the Council's Internet Site. By entering the Council Chamber you are consenting to be filmed and the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting and / or training purposes.

**You are welcome to speak Welsh in the meeting.**

Please inform us by noon, two working days before the meeting.

**Next Meeting:** Thursday, 5 March 2020 at 5.00 pm



**Huw Evans  
Head of Democratic Services  
Guildhall,  
Swansea.**

**Tuesday, 14 January 2020**

**To: All Members of the Council**

# Agenda Item 3.



City and County of Swansea

## Minutes of the Council

Council Chamber - Guildhall, Swansea

Wednesday, 27 November 2019 at 5.00 pm

**Present:** Councillor D W W Thomas (Chair) Presided

### Councillor(s)

C Anderson  
J E Burtonshaw  
M C Child  
N J Davies  
A M Day  
C R Doyle  
M Durke  
C R Evans  
V M Evans  
E W Fitzgerald  
L S Gibbard  
K M Griffiths  
J A Hale  
D W Helliwell  
T J Hennegan  
C A Holley

### Councillor(s)

B Hopkins  
D H Hopkins  
L James  
O G James  
Y V Jardine  
J W Jones  
M H Jones  
P K Jones  
S M Jones  
A S Lewis  
M B Lewis  
W G Lewis  
C E Lloyd  
P Lloyd  
I E Mann  
P M Matthews

### Councillor(s)

P N May  
H M Morris  
C L Philpott  
S Pritchard  
A Pugh  
J A Raynor  
P B Smith  
R V Smith  
R C Stewart  
M Sykes  
M Thomas  
W G Thomas  
L J Tyler-Lloyd  
G D Walker  
L V Walton  
T M White

### Officer(s)

Huw Evans	Head of Democratic Services
Adam Hill	Deputy Chief Executive / Director of Resources
Sarah Lackenby	Chief Digital & Transformation Officer
Tracey Meredith	Chief Legal Officer / Monitoring Officer
Phil Roberts	Chief Executive
Ben Smith	Chief Finance Officer / Section 151 Officer

### Apologies for Absence

Councillor(s): P M Black, S E Crouch, J P Curtice, P Downing, W Evans, R Francis-Davies, S J Gallagher, P R Hood-Williams, L R Jones, M A Langstone, D Phillips, C Richards, K M Roberts, B J Rowlands, M Sherwood, A H Stevens, D G Sullivan, G J Tanner and L G Thomas

---

## 94. Disclosures of Personal and Prejudicial Interests.

Chief Legal Officer gave advice regarding the potential personal and prejudicial interests that Councillors and / Officers may have on the agenda.

The Head of Democratic Services reminded Councillors and Officers that the

“Disclosures of Personal and Prejudicial Interests” sheet should only be completed if the Councillor / Officer actually had an interest to declare. Nil returns were not required. Councillors and Officers were also informed that any declarable interest must be made orally and in writing on the sheet.

In accordance with the provisions of the Code of Conduct adopted by the City and County of Swansea the following interests were declared:

- 1) Councillors C Anderson, J A Hale, M B Lewis, C E Lloyd, P Lloyd, R V Smith & T M White declared a Personal Interest in Minute 104 “Council Tax Base Calculation 2020/2021”;
- 2) Councillors C Anderson, J E Burtonshaw, M C Child, N J Davies, A M Day, C R Doyle, M Durke, C R Evans, V M Evans, E W Fitzgerald, K M Griffiths, J A Hale, D W Helliwell, T J Hennegan, C A Holley, B Hopkins, D H Hopkins, L James, O G James, Y V Jardine, J W Jones, M H Jones, P K Jones, S M Jones, A S Lewis, M B Lewis, W G Lewis, C E Lloyd, P Lloyd, I E Mann, P M Matthews, P N May, C L Philpott, S Pritchard, A Pugh, J A Raynor, P B Smith, R V Smith, R C Stewart, M Sykes, D W W Thomas, M Thomas, W G Thomas, L Tyler-Lloyd, L V Walton, G D Walker & T M White declared a Personal Interest in Minute 106 “Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales (IRPW) Draft Annual Report 2020-2021 - Consultation”.
- 3) Councillor N J Davies declared a Personal Interest in Minute 108 “Reimbursement of Costs of Care”.
- 4) Councillor W G Thomas declared a Personal & Prejudicial Interest in Minute 99 “Public Questions” and withdrew from the meeting during a question on Councillors Question 4.

#### Officers

- 1) A Hill declared a Personal & Prejudicial Interest in Minute 102 “Amendments to the Council Constitution” and withdrew from the meeting prior to its discussion.

#### **95. Minutes.**

**Resolved** that the following Minutes be approved and signed as a correct record:

- 1) Ordinary Meeting of Council held on 24 October 2019.

#### **96. Written Responses to Questions asked at the Last Ordinary Meeting of Council.**

The Chief Legal Officer submitted an information report setting out the written responses to questions asked at the last Ordinary Meeting of Council.

**97. Announcements of the Presiding Member.**

**1) Condolences**

**i) Former Councillor Bill Hughes**

The Presiding Member referred with sadness to the recent death of former Councillor Bill Hughes. Bill served the Mumbles Community on the former Swansea City Council and former West Glamorgan County Council.

**ii) Former Councillor Jean Taverner**

The Presiding Member referred with sadness to the recent death of former Councillor Jean Taverner. Jean served the Uplands Community on the former Swansea City Council.

All present stood as a mark of sympathy and respect.

**2) Filming, Recording and Photography at Council Meetings**

The Presiding Member stated that under the Authority's "Filming, Recording and Photography at Council Meetings" Policy (adopted on 24 November 2011), he had allowed a film crew from Amazon News Media to film this Council Meeting.

**3) Local Authority Pension Fund (LAPF) Investment Awards 2019**

The Presiding Member stated that the City and County of Swansea Pension Fund had won the Best Approach to Sustainable Investing Award at the recent LAPF Investment Awards 2019.

The LAPF Investments Awards were established in 2015 in order to celebrate outstanding achievement in the Local Government Pension Schemes (LGPS). Over the years, an award from LAPF Investments Awards has come to be recognised as mark of excellence in the field of pension provision in the LGPS.

Karen Cobb from the Pension Team and Councillor C E Lloyd were present to receive the award.

**98. Announcements of the Leader of the Council.**

**1) Men Shed Initiative**

The Leader of the Council stated that he had set aside a £25,000 fund aimed at supporting the Men Shed Initiative.

**2) Swansea Christmas Parade 2019**

The Leader of the Council congratulated Swansea's Special Events Team and Councillor Robert Francis-Davies for their work in ensuring a very successful Christmas Parade 2019.

The Parade formed part of the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of City status and saw hundreds of local people taking part. Thousands of people turned up to enjoy the excellent event.

**3) Together at Christmas 2018**

The Leader of the Council stated that JR Events & Catering were working with the Authority to deliver the Together at Christmas 2019 event on 19 December 2019.

A free two course Christmas lunch will be provided at the Brangwyn Hall between 12 noon and 3.00pm to the Homeless, Vulnerable and those In Need. He thanked all for assisting during the event.

**4) Swansea Central Phase 1 "The Arena"**

The Leader of the Council stated that work on the Arena project had commenced earlier in the week.

**99. Public Questions.**

A number of questions were asked by members of the public.

The relevant Cabinet Member(s) responded.

Those questions requiring written responses are listed below:

- a)** Janet Lovell and Shey Edlington Douglas submitted the following questions respectively; relating to Minute 109 "Councillors' Questions" – Questions 5 & 10, 5G:
- i) "Given the repeated evidence of the collapse of bee colonies following exposure to quite small quantities of WiFi radiation, what steps are the council taking to protect local parks, wild life and bee colonies from the proven damaging effects of 5G radiation when it is activated in Swansea?"*
  - ii) "Swansea council has officially declared a climate emergency so how can councillors stand back as the tech industry installs the infrastructure for 5G given that the anticipated carbon foot print of just 4G equivalent to the whole world's aviation industry combined is set to double by 2020 but will exponentially increase with 5G?"*

The Leader of the Council stated that a written response would be provided.

**Note:** The Leader of the Council also offered to meet with Susie Jewell, Janet Lovell and Shey Edlington Douglas in order to discuss the questions.

- b)** Nortridge Perrott submitted the following questions, relating to Minute 109 "Councillors' Questions" (Questions 7 & 11, Houses in Multiple Occupation (HMO's)):
- i) "Could the Council say if this PINS decision is susceptible to similar s288 Statutory Challenge/Review as the sandwiching policy within H9 was not considered in the reasoning given?"*
  - ii) Whose view of the Sustainable Devt Principle, Well Being objectives and the WCFG Act –Goal of Cohesive Communities should prevail or be preferred?*
  - iii) What specific actions are being undertaken by the Council to rectify, remedy or otherwise correct this PINS challenge to the H9 policy and say how and when during the AMR Process the CCS will reflect any procedural and substantive deficiencies in the operation of the LPA or H9 policy?*
  - iv) What statutory guidance and / or ministerial directions to PINS Inspectors could be litigated to achieve consistency and comprehensibility and does the CCS think that the WFG Act Commissioner [Menu for Action for Planning actors] is helpful / useful?*
  - v) Is this accurate for the Council [CCS] and say what is the basis of the £2.4mn investment figure & say if the s13A Provisions were used?*
  - vi) Does the Council have any plans to promote, instigate or otherwise facilitate the above modus operandi within the CCS area and describe the consequent use of the s13A Provisions?"*

The Delivery & Performance Cabinet Member stated that a written response would be provided.

**Note:** The Delivery & Performance Cabinet Member also offered to meet with Nortridge Perrott in order to discuss the questions.

**100. Presentation - None.**

No presentations were received.

**101. Standards Committee Annual Report 2018-2019.**

The Chair of the Standards Committee, Jill Burgess submitted the Standards Committee Annual Report 2018-2019 for information. The report set out the work of the Standards Committee during that period.

**102. Amendments to the Council Constitution.**

The Presiding Member, Monitoring Officer and Head of Democratic Services jointly submitted a report seeking to amend in order to simplify, improve and / or add to the Council Constitution in relation to the following areas:

- a) Part 3 "Responsibility for Functions" - "Chief Executive's Appraisal & Remuneration Committee Terms of Reference";
- b) Part 4 "Rules of Procedure" - "Land Transaction Procedure Rules".

**Resolved that:**

- 1) The Chief Executive's Appraisal & Remuneration Committee' Terms of Reference" be amended to read:

*"This Committee is exempt from the Committee Balance Rules in order to allow the following membership:*

- *Leader & Deputy Leader of the Ruling Group;*
  - *Leader and Deputy Leader of Largest Opposition Group;*
  - *Leader only of other Political Groups;*
  - *3 other Councillors from the Ruling Group.*
- a) *Responsible for the Performance Appraisal and objective setting of the Chief Executive.*
  - b) *Assisting the Chief Executive in the annual appraisal of the Deputy Chief Executive and endorsing the objectives set for the Deputy Chief Executive and agreeing the Deputy Chief Executive's salary banding for performance related pay.*

**Note:**

*Where the Authority proposes to appoint a Chief Officer or Deputy Chief Officer, and the remuneration which it proposes to pay to the chief officer is £100,000 or more per annum, it must:*

- i) *Draw up a statement specifying:*
  - *The duties of the officer concerned, and*
  - *Any qualifications or qualities to be sought in the person to be appointed.*
- ii) *Make arrangements for the post to be publicly advertised in such a way as is likely to bring it to the attention of persons who are qualified to apply for it; and*
- iii) *Make arrangements for a copy of the statement mentioned in a) to be sent to any person on request.*



*The Authority is not required to publicly advertise, if it proposes to appoint the Chief Officer for a period of no longer than 12 months."*

- 2) Paragraphs 3 and 4 of Appendix 1 "Concessionary Letting Policy" of the Land Transaction Procedure Rules be amended to read:

*"3 The General Disposal Consent (Wales) 2003 Order came into force on 31 December 2003. This Order removed the former requirement for the Council to seek a specific consent for a disposal at an undervalue where the Council considers that the disposal is in the interests of the economic, social or environmental well-being of the whole or part of its area, or any or all persons resident or present in its area and the undervalue is **up to and including** £2,000,000 or less.*

*4 Under the Council's Constitution a Responsible Officer has delegated authority to exercise functions for which he or she has budgetary, managerial, operational or statutory authority provided that the Cabinet does not itself make a decision in a particular case. At present, the exercise of the executive functions by an Officer in relation to estate management on the disposal of a freehold or leasehold interest is limited up to **and including** £500,000."*

### **103. Amendments to the Council Constitution.**

The Presiding Member, Monitoring Officer and Head of Democratic Services jointly submitted a report seeking to amend in order to simplify, improve and / or add to the Council Constitution in relation to the following areas:

- a) Part 4 "Rules of Procedure" - "Contract Procedure Rules".

**Resolved** that:

- 1) The Contract Procedure Rules be replaced with the version as outlined in Appendix A of the report.

### **104. Council Tax Base Calculation 2020/2021.**

The Leader of the Council submitted a report detailing the calculation of the Council Tax Base for the City and County of Swansea, its Community / Town Councils and the Swansea Bay Port Health Authority for 2020-2021. The Council is required to determine the Council Tax Bases for 2020-2021 by 31 December 2019.

**Resolved** that:

- 1) The calculation of the Council Tax Bases for 2020-2021 be approved;
- 2) In accordance with the Local Authorities (Calculation of Tax Base) (Wales) Regulations 1995, as amended, the calculation by the City and County of Swansea Council for the Year 2020-2021 shall be:

<b>For the whole area</b>	91,923
<b>For the area of Community / Town Councils:</b>	
Bishopston	1,986
Clydach	2,661
Gorseinon	3,319
Gowerton	1,972
Grovesend	426
Ilston	327
Killay	2,148
Llangennith, Llanmadoc and Cheriton	508
Llangyfelach	947
Llanrhidian Higher	1,626
Llanrhidian Lower	341
Llwchwr	3,446
Mawr	762
Mumbles	9,822
Penllergaer	1,437
Pennard	1,482
Penrice	426
Pontarddulais	2,340
Pontlliw and Tircoed	1,039
Port Eynon	433
Reynoldston	300
Rhossili	190
Three Crosses	715
Upper Killay	589
<b>For the area of the Swansea Bay Port Health Authority</b>	<b>63,778</b>

**105. Treasury Management – Interim Year Review Report 2019/20.**

The Section 151 Officer submitted an information report to receive and note the Treasury Management Interim Year Review Report 2019/2020.

**106. Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales (IRPW) Draft Annual Report 2020-2021 - Consultation.**

The Head of Democratic Services submitted a report informing Council of the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales (IRPW) Draft Annual Report 2020-2021 and outlined the determinations proposed by the IRPW. The report also contained the recommended draft response of the Democratic Services Committee of 6 November 2019 to the consultation.

The Head of Democratic Services also referred to a proposed determination of the IRPW in relation to publication of the costs of Reimbursement of Costs of Care. He stated that “*relevant authorities should only publish the total amount reimbursed during the year*”. As the publication of the Reimbursement of Costs of Care against an individual was a barrier for those with caring responsibilities to claim, he proposed that this element of the IRPW report be implemented with immediate effect.

**Resolved** that:

- 1) The comments and observations as set out in Appendix A of the report be adopted as the Authority's formal response to the IRPW;
- 2) The Authority cease the publication of the amounts claimed by individual Councillors in relation to the Reimbursement of Costs of Care and that an annual amount of the total claimed by Councillors and Co-opted members be published.

**107. Scrutiny Dispatches – Quarterly Impact Report.**

The Chair of the Scrutiny Programme Committee submitted an information report setting out the Scrutiny Dispatches - Quarterly Impact Report.

**108. Reimbursement of Costs of Care.**

The Head of Democratic Services submitted an information report aimed at promoting the take up of the Reimbursement of Costs of Care.

**109. Councillors' Questions.**

1) **Part A 'Supplementary Questions'**

Six (6) Part A 'Supplementary Questions' were submitted. The relevant Cabinet Member(s) responded by way of written answers contained in the Council Summons.

Those supplementary question(s) required a written response are listed below:

**Question 1**

Councillor C A Holley asked the relevant Cabinet Member:

*"Can you please specifically outline what the surplus car park monies were used for?"*

The Environment & infrastructure Management Cabinet Member stated that a written response would be provided.

**Question 2**

Councillor SM Jones asked the relevant Cabinet Member:

*"Could the Cabinet Member look into the possibility of placing an Amnesty Skip at Civic Amenity Sites at certain periods of the year?"*

The Environment & infrastructure Management Cabinet Member stated that he would look into the possibility of providing an occasional amnesty skip.

2) Part B 'Questions not requiring Supplementary Questions'

Five (5) Part B 'Questions not requiring Supplementary Questions' were submitted.

The meeting ended at 6.43 pm

**Chair**

# Agenda Item 4.



## Report of the Chief Legal Officer

Council – 23 January 2020

### Written Responses to Questions asked at the Last Ordinary Meeting of Council

The report provides an update on the responses to Questions asked during the Ordinary Meeting of Council on 27 November 2019.

#### For Information

#### 1. Introduction

- 1.1 It was agreed at Council on 8 April 2010 that a standing item be added to the Council Summons entitled “Written Responses to Questions Asked at the Last Ordinary Meeting of Council”.
- 1.2 A “For Information” report will be compiled by the Democratic Services Team collating all written responses from the last Ordinary Meeting of Council and placed in the Agenda Pack;
- 1.3 Any consequential amendments be made to the Council Constitution.

#### 2. Responses

- 2.1 Responses to questions asked during the last ordinary meeting of Council are included as Appendix A.

**Background Papers:** None

**Appendices:** Appendix A (Questions & Responses)

**Providing Council with Written Responses to Questions asked at Council  
27 November 2019**

1.	<p><b>Janet Lovell and Shey Edlington Douglas</b></p> <p><b>In relation to Minute 99 – “Public Questions” – Questions 5 &amp; 10, 5G</b></p> <p>1. “Given the repeated evidence of the collapse of bee colonies following exposure to quite small quantities of WiFi radiation, what steps are the council taking to protect local parks, wild life and bee colonies from the proven damaging effects of 5G radiation when it is activated in Swansea?”</p> <p>2. “Swansea Council has officially declared a climate emergency so how can councillors stand back as the tech industry installs the infrastructure for 5G given that the anticipated carbon foot print of just 4G equivalent to the whole world’s aviation industry combined is set to double by 2020 but will exponentially increase with 5G?”</p> <p><b>Response of the Leader</b></p> <p>May I take this opportunity to let you know that the safety of our citizens and wild life is always going to be paramount when Swansea Council roll out new technologies and innovations.</p> <p>Public Health England (“PHE”) has recently updated its advice in respect of 5G and states: “It is possible that there may be a small increase in overall exposure to radio waves when 5G is added to an existing network or in a new area. However, the overall exposure is expected to remain low relative to guidelines and, as such, there should be no consequences for public health.</p> <p>Even though there is currently no specific fixed date around the implementation of 5G in Swansea, it has the potential to provide a new level of underlying connectivity to transform services within our City and help us become a smarter city, delivering huge cost and time savings.</p> <p>Matt Warman MP (Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Digital and Broadband) has recently written to all local authorities outlining his thoughts on 5G and confirming that he will be working with Ofcom, PHE and the telecommunication network operators to help us understand more about the technology and the science relating to any 5G health concerns.</p> <p>The telecommunication network providers also have responsibilities on health and well-being and they are committed to follow the International Commission on Non-Ionizing Radiation Protection guidelines (ICNIRP) guidelines.</p> <p>ICNIRP is an independent organisation which is formally recognized by the World Health Organisation. It issues guidelines on exposure to electromagnetic fields, based upon the consensus view of a large amount of research carried out over many years.</p> <p>I can assure you, Swansea Council will continue to work with UK and Welsh governments to investigate the impacts of 5G technology and discuss our finding with all stakeholders. Page 12</p>
----	--

2.

**Nortridge Perrot**

**In relation to Minute 99 – “Public Questions” – Questions 7 & 11, HMOs**

1. “Could the Council say if this PINS decision is susceptible to similar s288 Statutory Challenge/Review as the sandwiching policy within H9 was not considered in the reasoning given?”
2. “Whose view of the Sustainable Devt Principle, Well Being objectives and the WCFG Act –Goal of Cohesive Communities should prevail or be preferred?”
3. “What specific actions are being undertaken by the Council to rectify, remedy or otherwise correct this PINS challenge to the H9 policy and say how and when during the AMR Process the CCS will reflect any procedural and substantive deficiencies in the operation of the LPA or H9 policy?”
4. What statutory guidance and / or ministerial directions to PINS Inspectors could be litigated to achieve consistency and comprehensibility and does the CCS think that the WFG Act Commissioner [Menu for Action for Planning actors] is helpful / useful?”
5. “Is this accurate for the Council [CCS] and say what is the basis of the £2.4mn investment figure & say if the s13A Provisions were used?”
6. “Does the Council have any plans to promote, instigate or otherwise facilitate the above modus operandi within the CCS area and describe the consequent use of the s13A Provisions?”

**Response of the Cabinet Member for Delivery & Performance**

1. Any planning inspectorate decision can be subject to challenge by the Council or third party if it is made correctly and within the required timescales.
2. Each planning application or appeal is considered on its own individual merits but as in this appeal the Planning Inspectorate represents the higher authority unless the decision is subsequently challenged through the courts by the Council or an interested party.
3. The Authority has been in discussions with the Chief Planning Inspector regarding the interpretation of LDP policy H9 and the Council is in the process of adopting Supplementary Planning Guidance on HMO’s and Purpose Built Student Accommodation to support its interpretation of policy.

In-line with the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (Section 76) and Local Development Plan (LDP) Regulation 37, the Council will publish and submit to Welsh Government (WG) an Annual Monitoring Report (AMR) setting out how the objectives of the Plan are being achieved. AMRs are the mechanism to assess the delivery and implementation of the Plan’s strategy. The first AMR following adoption of the LDP earlier this year is due by 31st October 2020 (in-line with the WG Guidance which states that the first AMR should be submitted by the 31<sup>st</sup>

October in the year following adoption of the LDP, unless less than 12 months would have passed since adoption). The published AMR will be publically available on the Council's website. Table 14 of the Swansea LDP sets out the monitoring indicators for the Plan which will form the basis of the AMR. The indicator for Policy H 9 on HMOs is Indicator 10 which is described on p341 of the LDP. The Council will monitor the number of registered HMOs within the Castle and Uplands Wards, to ensure the number of HMOs as a proportion of the total number of residential properties within the HMO Management Area does not significantly exceed the 25% threshold. Council databases will be used as the data source. A trigger point is identified where action may be required if the average concentration of HMO's within the Lower Super Output Areas of the HMO Management Area either reduces or increases by +/- 2% from the base level, which is currently around 25%.

4. The policies of the LDP have been subject to Examination. The Examination process found the Plan to be sound and in accordance with the objectives of the WFG Act and Planning Policy Wales (Edition 10<sup>th</sup>). It is a matter of interpretation whether Inspectors consider a particular proposal complies with the requirements of locally adopted policy and National Guidance, based upon the circumstances and evidence before them at the time of determination.

5. The Council has provided Welsh Government funded Houses into Homes / Landlord loans (up to end of June 2019) of £2.55 million to bring back into use 65 empty properties creating 110 units of accommodation. The loan scheme does not use s.13a powers.

6. Welsh Government is currently looking at introducing a national private sector leasing scheme. The Council is committed to considering all possible options, including private sector leasing, to assist empty home owners in bringing their properties back in to use.

3. **Councillor C A Holley**

**In relation to Minute 109 "Councillors' Questions" Q1**

"Can you please specifically outline what the surplus car park monies were used for?"

**Response of the Cabinet Member for Environment & Infrastructure Management**

The income and expenditure in car parking forms part of the overall budget for Highways and Transportation. In addition to this, any surpluses from on street parking and traffic enforcement are reinvested in improving on street enforcement and also used for traffic and road safety improvement schemes in line with Section 55 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984.

The overall funding contributes to;

- Maintenance and improvements within the car parks
- Supporting the Council's Park and Ride operation
- Traffic Management and Road Safety including providing a school crossing patrol service, road traffic advice, speed surveys and analysis and collision analysis and accident investigation.



4.

**Councillor SM Jones**

**In relation to Minute 109 “Councillors’ Questions” Q2**

“Could the Cabinet Member look into the possibility of placing an Amnesty Skip at Civic Amenity Sites at certain periods of the year?”

**Response of the Cabinet Member for Environment & Infrastructure Management**

In response to the suggestion for periodic amnesty skips for wood at the Recycling Centres, I would not support this due to the fact that this wood may not be recyclable going forward if circumstances change, the confusion this could cause for residents leading to them taking wood to those sites outside the amnesty period, the adverse impact on the Recycling Centres other materials, there not being room to do this at Penlan or Garngoch following improvements for other waste streams, and due to increased costs.

We did experience a small number of complaints in the first few months of implementing these changes. However the number of complaints have reduced, and in the last 3 months we have received no complaints at all. It now appears that this change has settled down well, and to introduce an ongoing varying service for wood is likely to cause more problems than benefits.

I have asked the Waste Team to explore options to ease queueing at Llansamlet HWRC at peak times such as Easter and May Day Bank Holidays.

# Agenda Item 9.



## Report of the Section 151 Officer

Council – 23 January 2020

### Adoption of the Council Tax Reduction Scheme

<b>Purpose:</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. To explain the requirement to annually consider whether to revise or replace the Council's existing Council Tax Reduction Scheme and the requirement to either adopt a new scheme or re-adopt the existing scheme by 31 January 2020.</li><li>2. To re-adopt the current scheme as set out in Section 3 of the report from 2020/21.</li></ol>
<b>Policy Framework:</b>	None
<b>Consultation:</b>	Legal, Finance and Access to Services.
<b>Recommendation:</b>	<p>It is recommended that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The Council Tax Reduction Schemes and Prescribed Requirements (Wales) Regulations 2013 ("the Prescribed Requirements Regulations") by the National Assembly for Wales (NAfW) on 26 November 2013, as amended be noted.</li><li>2. The amendments to "the Prescribed Requirements Regulations" contained in The Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Prescribed Requirements and Default Scheme) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2020, considered and approved by NAfW on 7 January 2020 be noted.</li><li>3. The outcome of the consultation exercise undertaken by the Council in November 2018 on the discretionary areas of the current scheme be noted.</li><li>4. The current scheme (2019/20) in relation to the discretionary areas (as set out in section 3) remain unchanged from 2020/21.</li></ol>

5. The Council adopts the scheme as set out in section 3 of this report and that any amendments to the regulations made by NAFW are reflected in the scheme.

**Report Author:** Julian Morgans

**Finance Officer:** Ben Smith

**Legal Officer:** Debbie Smith

**Access to Services Officer:** Rhian Millar

## **1 Background**

1.1 Following the abolition of the national Council Tax Benefit scheme on 31 March 2013, responsibility for providing Council Tax support in Wales was devolved to the Welsh Government (WG) and is known as the Council Tax Reduction Scheme (CTRS).

1.2 The CTRS is governed by two sets of regulations. These regulations prescribe the main features of the schemes to be adopted in Wales:-

- The Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Default Scheme) (Wales) Regulations 2013 (“the Default Scheme Regulations”) as amended.
- The Council Tax Reduction Schemes and Prescribed Requirements (Wales) Regulations 2013 (“the Prescribed Requirements Regulations”) as amended.

1.3 The regulations contain an obligation that an authority must consider each financial year whether to revise its scheme or to replace it with another scheme. Any revision or replacement must be made no later than 31 January, preceding the financial year for which the revision or replacement scheme will take effect.

1.4 Although there is a national scheme for Wales, within the Prescribed Requirements Regulations, there is limited discretion given to the Council to apply additional discretionary elements that are more generous than the national scheme. These are :-

- The ability to increase the standard extended reduction period of 4 weeks given for example to persons who have ceased to receive qualifying benefits after they return to work, where they have previously been receiving a Council Tax Reduction (CTR) that is to end as a result of their return to work;
- Discretion to increase the amount of War Disablement Pensions and War Widows and War Widowers Pensions which is to be disregarded when calculating income of the applicant; and

- The ability to backdate applications for CTR for periods longer than the standard period of three months before the claim is made.
- 1.5 The Council adopted a CTRS from 2019/20 on 24 January 2019. It is a requirement of the Prescribed Requirements Regulations that the Council adopts a CTRS by 31 January 2020, regardless of whether it applies any of the discretionary elements set out in paragraph 1.4 above. If the Council fails to make a scheme, then a default scheme shall apply under the provisions of the Default Scheme Regulations. The Council can only apply discretion if it makes its own scheme under the Prescribed Requirements Regulations.
- 1.6 An amending set of regulations was laid before the NAFW on 26 November 2019, to uprate financial figures used to assess CTR entitlement, in line with the cost of living increases. The amending set of regulations also incorporate changes to reflect consequential and technical amendments required to take account of inter-related changes to welfare benefits and other legislation made by the UK Government.
- 1.7 The amendment regulations were approved by the Assembly on 7 January 2020. The Council must take account of these regulations, The Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Prescribed Requirements and Default Scheme) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2020<sup>1</sup>, when adopting the scheme.

<sup>1</sup> These regulations can be accessed at:

<http://senedd.assembly.wales/mgIssueHistoryHome.aspx?IId=27013&Opt=0>

## **2 Consultation**

- 2.1 A consultation exercise on the discretionary elements within the CTR scheme was conducted over the period 5 November 2018 to 2 December 2018 and advertised in a press release. An on-line survey form was placed on the Council web-site and consultation forms were available at the Contact Centre, District Housing Offices and libraries. Information was also sent to members, precepting authorities and various third sector agencies. A summary of the responses to this consultation can be found in Appendix A.
- 2.2 The Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Prescribed Requirements and Default Scheme) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2015, approved by NAFW 20 January 2015, included a change which removed the requirement for Local Authorities to publish a draft scheme and consult interested persons where a Billing Authority revises a scheme in consequence of amendments made to the Prescribed Requirement Regulations. The effect of this amendment is to remove the requirement for local authorities to consult in relation to changes made by Welsh Ministers where authorities have no discretion (as opposed to the discretionary areas of the scheme outlined in 1.4).

- 2.3 As this report contains a recommendation that the current scheme is not replaced or changed from 2020/2021, other than to include amendments contained in the “Amendment Regulations” (explained in 1.6 above), there is no requirement for the Council to consult, as authorities have no discretion in relation to these amendments.

### **3 Adoption of the Council Tax Reduction Scheme**

- 3.1 The Council is required to adopt a scheme by 31 January 2020 under the Council Tax Reduction Schemes and Prescribed Requirements (Wales) Regulations 2013 as amended, regardless of whether it chooses to apply any of the discretionary elements. If the Council fails to make a scheme, then a default scheme will apply under the Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Default Scheme) (Wales) Regulations 2013 (as amended).
- 3.2 As explained in 1.6 above, each year WG needs to amend the CTRS 2013 Regulations to ensure that the assessment calculation for CTR recipients is up-rated. The Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Prescribed Requirements and Default Scheme) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2020 were laid on 26 November 2019. As well as the up-rating provisions, these “Amendment Regulations” incorporate various technical and consequential amendments.
- 3.3 It is recommended that the Council adopts a Scheme from 2020/21 under “the Prescribed Requirements Regulations”, and any amendments made to those regulations by the “Amendment Regulations”, to include all the elements that must be included in the scheme and those discretionary elements set out in the table at Paragraph 3.5 below.
- 3.4 Part 5 of the Council Tax Reduction Schemes and Prescribed Requirements (Wales) Regulations 2013 (Other matters that must be included in an authority’s scheme) identifies which elements of the prescribed requirements of a scheme are minimum only requirements and in respect of which local authorities have an element of discretion.
- 3.5 Taking account of :
- the consultation responses for the current local scheme, (see Appendix A) relating to the discretionary elements, noting that no changes have been proposed for 2020/21.
  - the current local scheme in relation to the treatment of War Disablement Pensions, War Widows Pensions and War Widowers Pensions for Housing Benefit, which disregards these payments in full,
  - the fixed funding available,

The recommendations in relation to the available discretionary elements are as follows in the table below:-

<u>Discretionary Elements</u>  <b>Part 5 - Other Matters that must be included in an authority's scheme</b>	<b>Prescribed Requirement Regulations</b>  <b>(Minimum Requirements)</b>	<b>Recommended Details to be Adopted with regard to Discretionary Elements</b>
<p>The ability to increase the standard extended reduction period of 4 weeks given to applicants where they have previously been receiving a CTR that is to end, as they have ceased receiving qualifying benefits as a result of returning to work, increasing their hours of work, or receiving increased earnings.</p> <p><i>Regulation 32 (3) and Regulation 33 (3), para (33) Schedule 1 and para (35) and (40) Schedule 6.</i></p>	<p>4 Weeks</p>	<p><u>Pensioners</u>: The 4 weeks period specified in para (33) Schedule 1 will apply, and</p> <p><u>Non- Pensioners</u>: The 4 weeks period specified in para (35) and (40) Schedule 6 will apply,</p>
<p>The ability to backdate applications of CTR for periods longer than the standard period of 3 months before the claim is made.</p> <p><i>Regulation 34 (4) and Paragraph (3) and (4) of Schedule 13.</i></p>	<p>3 Months</p>	<p><u>Pensioners</u>: The period of 3 months specified in para (3) Schedule 13 will apply,</p> <p><u>Non-Pensioners</u>: The period of 3 months specified in para (4), Schedule 13 will apply,</p>
<p>The ability to disregard more than the statutory weekly £10 of income received in respect of War Disablement Pensions and War Widows Pensions and War Widowers Pensions (disregarded when calculating income of the applicant);</p> <p><i>Regulation 34 (5), Paragraphs 1(a) and 1(b) Schedule 4 and Paragraphs 20(a) and 20(b) of Schedule 9</i></p>	<p>£10</p>	<p><u>Pensioners</u>: The total value of any pension specified in para 1(a) and 1(b) Schedule 4 will be disregarded.</p> <p><u>Non-Pensioners</u>: The total value of any pension specified in para 20(a) and 20(b) Schedule 9 will be disregarded.</p>

#### 4. Equality and Engagement Implications

4.1 The Council is subject to the Public Sector Equality Duty (Wales) and must, in the exercise of their functions, have due regard to the need to:

- Eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct prohibited by the Act.
- Advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.

- Foster good relations between people who share a protected characteristic and those who do not.

Our Equality Impact Assessment process ensures that we have paid due regard to the above.

- 4.2 The WG undertook a comprehensive regulatory impact assessment in respect of the national Scheme regulations, in November 2013.
- 4.3 The Council has undertaken a fresh consultation exercise in relation to the discretionary elements in November 2018 as a matter of good practice as the previous consultation exercise had been carried out in 2014.
- 4.4 A local equality impact assessment (EIA) was carried out by the Council in January 2014, for the 2014/15 scheme, which was reviewed each year since then as there were no changes to the discretionary elements in any of the subsequent amendment regulations.
- 4.5 A fresh local equality impact assessment (EIA) was carried out by the Council in December 2018 to keep the EIA in line with the most recent consultation exercise and to update the format of the report.
- 4.6 It should be noted that in terms of equality impact there are no significant changes in the scheme recommended from 2020/21 compared to 2019/20. As this is a national scheme, the Council cannot vary the provisions other than those discretionary areas detailed in 1.4 above, which are proposed to remain the same as exist in the current (2019/20) local scheme. The Revenues and Benefits service will continue to provide advice to maximise taxpayers' benefit income, award appropriate discounts and exemptions and signpost customers to relevant agencies, where appropriate, so they can obtain independent advice.

## **5. Financial Implications**

- 5.1 Welsh local authorities receive a fixed sum provision from WG for the CTRS. This is fundamentally different to the funding received from DWP, for the former Council Tax Benefit scheme, which was demanded and almost fully funded on a pound for pound basis. Any changes that affect the amount of CTR to be paid, for example due to Council Tax increases, increases in customers' CTR entitlement or increases in the number of customers actually claiming CTR, exposes the Council to financial risk, as the shortfall between the amount of CTR paid out and the funding received from WG, result in authorities having to bear the additional cost.
- 5.2 The table below shows the number of current CTR recipients in Swansea, the latest estimate of CTR paid for 2019/20 and the latest estimated shortfall of £2.382M which has to be met by the Council.

<b>Current CTR recipients</b>	<b>Current CTR recipients who receive 100% CTR</b>	<b>Latest estimate of CTR to be paid in 2019/20</b>	<b>Fixed funding received from WG for 2019/20</b>	<b>Estimated shortfall between funding and CTR paid to recipients.</b>
22,384	17,858	£21.463M	£19.081M	-£2.382M

- 5.3 The amount of CTR funding for distribution in 2020/21 in Wales was detailed in the provisional settlement made on 16 December 2019. The funding available for the whole of Wales is £244M with this Council's provisional allocation being £19.012M.
- 5.4 The table in 5.2 shows the estimated shortfall between the CTR to be paid out and the fixed funding received from WG for 2019/20.
- 5.5 Based on these figures, for every 1% increase in Council Tax levels in 2020/21, the yield will be reduced by an estimated £214,636 to reflect the cost of the CTRS.

## **6. Legal Implications**

The Council is obliged to make a CTRS under the Prescribed Requirements Regulations as amended by 31 January 2020. Although the legislation provides for a default scheme to apply in the absence of the Council making a scheme, the Council is nevertheless under a statutory duty to adopt its own scheme, even if it chooses not to apply any of the discretionary elements.

Section 149 of the Equality Act 2010 requires Local Authorities to have "due regard" to their public sector equality duties when exercising their functions.

There are no other legal implications other than those already highlighted in this report.

**Background Papers:**  
Equality Impact Assessment

**Appendices:**  
Appendix A: Summary of the responses to the CTRS consultation undertaken in November 2018.



1.1 A consultation exercise was conducted over the period 5<sup>th</sup> November 2018 to 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2018 and advertised in a press release. An on-line survey form was placed on the Council web-site and consultation forms were available at the Contact Centre, District Housing Offices and libraries. Information was also sent to members, precepting authorities and various third sector agencies.

1.2 **Summary of Responses**

- a) A total of 23 responses were received. 8 were completed on line and 15 written responses received.
- b) All 23 responses were completed by individuals with no one indicating they were completing on behalf of an organisation.

1.3 **Responses to the Three Discretionary Areas**

**I. Ability to Increase the standard Extended Payment Period of 4 weeks.**

Question 1 on the consultation form:		
Discretionary element	Proposal	Responses
The ability to increase the standard extended payment period of 4 weeks given to people after they return to work when they have been in receipt of a relevant qualifying benefit for at least 26 weeks.	The Council proposes that the existing 4 week standard extended payment should remain unaltered. Do you think this is reasonable?	<p>23 responses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 14 said it was reasonable.</li> <li>• 8 said it was not.</li> <li>• 1 said "don't know".</li> </ul>
	If you indicated no to the above, please outline what you consider the period should be?	<p>Of the 8 who thought it was not reasonable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 1 opted for no extended payment.</li> <li>• 2 for 2 weeks.</li> <li>• 3 for 6 weeks.</li> <li>• 1 stated other.</li> <li>• 1 made no selection.</li> </ul> <p>There were 2 'please specify' responses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 months to allow monthly payments</li> <li>• At least 26 weeks</li> </ul>

**II. Discretion to increase the amount of War Disablement and War and War Widows Pensions which will be disregarded when calculating income.**

<b>Question 2 on the consultation form:</b>		
<b>Discretionary element</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Responses</b>
Discretion to disregard part or the whole amount of War Disablement Pensions and War Widows Pensions when calculating income.	The Council proposes to continue to disregard all of this income, as it is currently disregarded for Council Tax Reduction. Do you think this is reasonable?	<p>23 responses.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 16 said it was reasonable.</li> <li>• 5 said it was not.</li> <li>• 2 answered “don’t know”</li> </ul>

**III. Ability to backdate the application of Council Tax Reduction Awards for more than the standard period of 3 months prior to the claim.**

<b>Question 3 on the consultation form:</b>		
<b>Discretionary element</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>Responses</b>
The ability to back date the application of Council Tax Reduction awards for customers for more than the standard period of 3 months prior to the claim.	The Council proposes to keep the maximum back date available to the 3 month statutory period. Do you think this is reasonable?	<p>23 responses.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 16 said it was reasonable.</li> <li>• 5 said it was not.</li> <li>• 2 answered “don’t know”.</li> </ul>
	If not, what period do you think is reasonable?	<p>Of the 5 who thought it was not reasonable,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 3 opted for a period of 6 months.</li> <li>• 2 for 12 months.</li> </ul>

# Agenda Item 10.



## Report of the Cabinet Member for Delivery & Performance

Council – 23 January 2020

### Membership of Committees

<b>Purpose:</b>	Council approves the nominations/amendments to the Council Bodies.
<b>Policy Framework:</b>	None.
<b>Consultation:</b>	Political Groups.
<b>Recommendation:</b>	It is recommended that:  1) The amendment to the Council Body listed in paragraph 2 be approved.
<b>Report Author:</b>	Gareth Borsden
<b>Legal Officer:</b>	Debbie Smith
<b>Finance Officer:</b>	N/A
<b>Access to Services Officer:</b>	N/A

#### 1. Introduction

- 1.1 Meetings of Council regularly agree and amend the membership of the various Committees/Council Bodies as reflected in the lists submitted by the Political Groups.

#### 2. Changes to Council Body Membership

- 2.1 The political groups have indicated that they have changes to the following Council Bodies:

##### **Poverty Reduction Policy Development Committee**

Remove Councillor H M Morris

Add Councillor L V Walton

#### 3. Financial Implications

- 3.1 There are no financial implications associated with this report.

#### 4. Legal Implications

- 4.1 There are no legal implications associated with this report.

**Background Papers:** None

**Appendices:** None

# Agenda Item 11.



Council – 23 January 2020

## Councillors' Questions

### Part A – Supplementaries

1	<p><b>Councillors Will Thomas &amp; Lyndon Jones</b></p> <p>We would like to congratulate the Cabinet Member for what seems to be a very popular Christmas parade.</p> <p>Could we please have the financial cost of the parade to the Council and the cost of last year's parade.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Investment, Regeneration &amp; Tourism</b></p> <p>The costs of the Christmas Parade for 2018 and 2019 are as follows; 2018 the cost was £68,423</p> <p>2019 we were budgeted to spend £60k. We are still awaiting final costs but we anticipate that the event will be on or very close to budget.</p>
2	<p><b>Councillors Mike Day, Mary Jones &amp; Lynda James</b></p> <p>When people click on the Council's website, a dialogue box appears which gives viewers information about Advertising settings. The box states "Advertising on this website helps protect the funding of services for our residents by generating income". Viewers are then given the opportunity to see a Vendors list and the Manage settings which includes the phrase "We and select companies may access and use your information for the below purposes". Can the relevant Cabinet Member or Leader tell Council the following information.</p> <p>A. Provide a full list of Vendors.</p> <p>B. State what due diligence process is applied to Vendors on the list for them to be on the list.</p> <p>C. How is revenue collected from the Vendors.</p> <p>D. How much revenue is anticipated for the 2019/20 year and how much has been collected.</p> <p>E. Can the Cabinet Member/Leader give Council a guarantee that all those listed on the Vendors list are engaged in ethically and environmentally acceptable activities.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Leader/Cabinet Member for Delivery &amp; Performance</b></p>

The Council Advertising Network (CAN) is an external company which provides the advertising service, including the permissions, for the Council. Their website can be viewed on <https://can-digital.net>

Many local councils in the UK use the Council Advertising Network, including Derby, Vale of Glamorgan and Torfaen.

On the external council sites and Staffnet, banner adverts are shown at the top of each page only, although there is an option for adverts to be displayed at the foot of the page and throughout the body of the page. Adverts are not displayed where the service user is communicating with us online through forms.

A. List provided separately at Appendix A.

B. CAN performs comprehensive business and technical checks to ensure each vendor is suitable to deliver brand safe advertising to the council. Business checks include credit history, vendor location and position in the market. Technical checks include where data is stored, checks for virus and malware and what security measures are in place to ensure the safety of the council and its customers.

C. Revenue is collected by CAN either by individual invoice or automatic payment. Payments are received monthly. Once collected a purchase order for the council revenue is forwarded to the Council each quarter so invoice can be raised.

D. £6,243.93 will be collected for 2019/20 via invoices currently being processed.

E. CAN has advised that advertising and services are delivered digitally so has little or no impact on the environment. CAN only signs vendors that deliver honest and ethical advertising. CAN monitors the advertising delivered and if an issue does arise then that vendor will be immediately removed from the ad delivery. Since CAN launched in 2014 they have stated that they have not had any issues of this nature.

**3 Councillors Jeff Jones, Chris Holley, Susan Jones**

The Council are borrowing £130 million for the City Deal. Will the Leader give a financial breakdown of where this money has been or will be spent.

**Response of the Leader**

The spending plans were fully set out in the recent FPR7 report to Cabinet in November 2019 which was subject to substantial scrutiny. The nature of the City Deal is that it is true that the Council must borrow the gross cost up front but it then receives a significant proportion back in grant (some £22m). The report also fully set out the use of other potential funding sources including grants, loans and capital receipts to reduce the net cost, and plans to use the Capital Equalisation Reserve to neutralise the short term impact on revenue budgets for at least the next 6 years. It is also anticipated that the developments will create new revenue streams for the taxpayer to assist with future borrowing repayments. Now that the scheme has been fully added to the capital programme it will be subject to the same reporting and monitoring as all other schemes in the capital programme.

4	<p><b>Councillors Cheryl Philpott, Wendy Fitzgerald &amp; Jeff Jones</b></p> <p>A number of planning applications have had a requirement that a proportion of the development be designated as 'affordable' housing. For clarity;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1.Does the council keep a list of designated properties.</li> <li>2.How many dwellings have been designated in the last 10 years.</li> <li>3.How many are still on the list/What has happened to the ones that are no longer on the list.</li> <li>4.How do people know that there are properties available.</li> <li>5.Who checks the criteria of applicants.</li> </ol> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Delivery &amp; Performance</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The Council does not hold a list of designated properties but occupation is governed by the requirements of the relevant Section 106 Agreements. The Section 106 (S106) affordable properties are transferred straight from the developer to the Registered Social Landlords (RSLs) and the management of the social rented and intermediate affordable properties are the responsibility of the RSL. The RSL designate the intermediate product used, intermediate sale e.g. shared ownership, shared equity, reduced market price or intermediate rent.</li> <li>2. The LDP states in Policy H2 that the target number of affordable homes to be delivered between 2010 – 2025 (i.e. during the Plan period) is 3,310 and that up until 2017 690 affordable homes had been delivered.</li> <li>3. The Council does not hold a list of designated properties but occupation is governed by the requirements of the relevant S106 Agreements.</li> <li>4. The RSLs allocate the social rented housing using their Allocations Policy. For intermediate for sale products the Council holds a register of interest, this register is forwarded to the RSL when a property becomes available. The properties are also advertised online.</li> <li>5. The RSL checks the applicant meets the criteria, they request and check evidence, financial etc.</li> </ol> <p>Note: To date affordable homes provided as part of the planning process via Section 106 agreements have been transferred to Registered Social Landlords. Future agreements will include an option for the Council to acquire the social rented 106 units alongside RSLs.</p>
5	<p><b>Councillors Cllrs Wendy Fitzgerald, Mike Day &amp; Mary Jones</b></p> <p>Following the outcomes of the recent Pisa tests, Wales remained the lowest performing country within the UK for all subjects. In reading tests, Wales scored below the average for OECD countries, while England, Scotland and Northern Ireland were all above average. Can the Cabinet Member comment on the fact that Wales, after more than 20 years of a Labour Government, still lags behind the rest of the UK.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Education Improvement, Learning &amp; Skills</b></p>

The question is about Wales as a whole, which is a matter for the WG Minister for Education. However, I can report some more satisfactory achievements for Swansea. In the previous cycle, the 2015 PISA results were published in December 2016. Since then the Lib Dem AM Kirsty Williams has been the Minister responsible for developing Wales's response to those results. As the Minister herself said in a published interview with the BBC on 3 December 2019: 'PISA is just one measure of an education system and cannot possibly tell the full story about our schools.'

The results of the 2018 PISA tests published at the beginning of December 2019 suggest that the mean score in reading (483) in Wales did not differ from the OECD average (487) to a statistically significant degree. Pupils in Wales showed relative strengths in the reading skills of 'locating information' and 'evaluating and reflecting' but performed less well in understanding. This was common across many OECD countries. Headteachers surveyed in Wales reported to the researchers a greater shortage of books and equipment than their counterparts in the rest of the UK. Pupils in Wales are less likely to read books and had more negative attitudes towards reading than pupils across the OECD. There is an issue with boys' reading habits. Whilst the scores for girls in reading increased, the average score for boys in Wales in reading was low when compared with the rest of the UK.

In Swansea and the rest of Wales we need to understand the reasons behind these reading habits, what happens at home in early years and what works in promoting reading especially among boys. Councillors as school governors in both the primary and secondary sectors have an important role in supporting and developing reading. Our Swansea Library service runs events for children supporting reading for pleasure.

What else should Swansea note from the latest PISA results? In Science, Wales's score (488) was close to the OECD average of 489, with girls performing better than boys. Wales's mean score on Maths (487) was similar to the OECD average with a noticeable improvement in girls' performance. The 'disadvantage gap' in Wales was lower than the OECD average. Across Wales it remains the case that pupils eligible for free school meals still score below those not eligible for free school meals. In Swansea schools at Key Stage 4, the average capped nine score for pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds is nearly five grades higher on average than similar pupils across Wales. The Swansea results reinforce the importance of using deprivation funding well by understanding what works. The Education Policy Development Committee has supported this approach leading to better dissemination of research findings.

Swansea Council Education department does not receive a school by school breakdown of the PISA results. The Council does not nominate the schools or pupils who participate in the PISA tests. PISA provides an All Wales snap-shot, one of many measures we use to consider how to provide the best education for the future of our learners. Prioritising education in Swansea has seen a steady increase in funding per pupil, an increase in training for serving teachers, research sharing and strong school- to-school support. Applications for teaching posts and senior leadership roles are high.

As a result outcomes in Swansea are strong relative to those in Wales. At Key Stage 4 in the capped nine measure, Swansea pupils achieve 14 points higher than those in Wales on average. This means that, on average, our pupils



	<p>achieve over two higher grades across their best nine GCSE or equivalent vocational qualifications than pupils across Wales as a whole. In the literacy, numeracy and science measures Swansea's pupils achieve higher grades than pupils across Wales. At Key Stage 5, Swansea A-level outcomes have continued to improve in schools and colleges. As the Cabinet Member for Education, Learning and Skills I am proud of the support given to schools by our Labour Council.</p>
6	<p><b>Councillors Linda Tyler-Lloyd &amp; Paxton Hood-Williams</b></p> <p>Can the Cabinet Member please shed some light on issues at Swansea Airport. For much of the year the airport has been flagged up on the National Air Traffic Services noticeboard as having no fuel or being unlicensed. There is also an issue of cattle on the runway, because of the poor state of the boundary fencing.</p> <p>The impact of this chronic and more acute recent progressive deterioration is to deter passing trade from visiting aircraft and also to make the airport unusable for any commercial flights. To make matters worse, I understand that the airport has now had its licence suspended.</p> <p>This is not good news, because this once thriving facility is being progressively managed into dereliction.</p> <p>Swansea is currently developing the City Deal, which will bring huge investment and jobs into the area. However, we are in competition with Cardiff and Bristol for investment, who both have thriving airports, while Swansea Airport is sending a signal out to would be investors who need the use of an airport, that Swansea is closed for business.</p> <p>This is very serious and I would be grateful if you could inform us of what steps the Council has and is taking to put this right.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Delivery &amp; Performance</b></p> <p>A report will be presented to Cabinet on the 20<sup>th</sup> February 2020 to address the current activities at Swansea Airport, including the temporary suspension of the Civil Aviation Authority (CAA) operating licence. The report will provide a number of recommendations to ensure operations can continue at the airport whilst safeguarding the Council from any future corporate liabilities.</p> <p>The reality of the situation is there is very little that can be done to manage the situation more effectively as the Council have no desire to operate the airport themselves. There is limited ability to find another tenant in the event of the current tenancy falling and there are further complications in that the various sub-tenants and licensees/users would have expectations around their continued use. Ultimately, the tenant may decide at some point in the future that it is no longer willing to subsidise the airport and in which case the company could become insolvent. In this scenario, the land would revert to the Council and the cost of decommissioning would be substantial. The chance of finding another tenant would prove very difficult after a period of closure as the CAA would be no doubt be hesitant about issuing a fresh licence without substantial investment.</p>

	<p>Unfortunately, Swansea Airport is only ever likely to be a recreational airport as commercial operations have previously failed despite substantial investment in the facility. Therefore, to compete with the likes of Cardiff and Bristol would prove very challenging, especially given that Cardiff airport is owned by the Welsh Government and recently announced pre-tax losses in the sum of £18.5m so is effectively being subsidised by the public purse.</p>
7.	<p><b>Councillors Chris Holley, Graham Thomas &amp; Kevin Griffiths</b></p> <p>Will the Cabinet Member inform Council what sanctions are available to pursue anyone damaging the grassed areas on the Kingsway or other areas of the city.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Environment &amp; Infrastructure</b></p> <p>The issue of verge damage is difficult to enforce. Driving a vehicle off the carriageway is a police matter but has to be witnessed. Parking on the verge is not an offence unless a traffic regulation order applies or the vehicle is causing an obstruction.</p> <p>Damage to the highway is an offence but specific damage needs to be proved, this is very difficult in terms of historic verges and is only generally actionable in terms of specific witnessed event causing damage. This could be particularly challenging to prove that damage had been caused by one particular vehicle.</p> <p>Pursuing any verge/grassed area damage would require witness statements and clear evidence.</p> <p>With reference to the Kingsway, the Traffic regulation Order relates to the entire extent of the adopted highway and as such any vehicle parked on the footway or grassed areas will be subject to enforcement and issue of a Penalty Charge Notice. It is hoped that such action will be unnecessary and that motorists will respect the high quality pedestrian areas. The recent damage on the Kingsway was rectified at the expense of the company which caused the damage.</p>
8.	<p><b>Councillors Wendy Fitzgerald, Gareth Sullivan &amp; Mary Jones</b></p> <p>Could the Cabinet Member advise whether it is possible for quad bikers who often create a nuisance and risk to walkers and damage the landscape can be legally banned from land in Council ownership.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Environment &amp; Infrastructure Management</b></p> <p>Where there are opportunities to physically restrict access to Council by scrambling bikes or quad bikes then these measures have been taken, most recently funded via Councillor's Community Budgets. Legal measures to restrict this type of usage are costly and are likely to be ineffectual as they do not act as a deterrent and enforcement is very difficult.</p>
9.	<p><b>Councillors Chris Holley, Mary Jones &amp; Peter May</b></p>

	<p>Will the Cabinet Member confirm that over 1500 lighting columns are to be cut down because of structural problems and can he further confirm when they are going to be to be replaced.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Environment &amp; Infrastructure Management</b></p> <p>There are no plans to remove 1500 columns from use. However a number of street lighting columns have been cut down and removed over the last 7 years due to structural concerns or failures. Some have been replaced on a priority basis, however there are a number which have not been replaced. We are continuing to assess the condition of all street lighting columns and equipment across the network in order to develop a robust asset management plan. This plan will inform the funding requirements over future years to enable ongoing maintenance of the lighting network as well as tackling the maintenance backlog.</p> <p>The asset management plan will be brought forward for consideration in the coming months for consideration by Cabinet.</p>
10.	<p><b>Councillors Peter Black, Graham Thomas &amp; Cheryl Philpott</b></p> <p>Will the Cabinet Member give an update on the implementation of Housing First.</p> <p><b>Response of the Cabinet Member for Homes, Energy &amp; Service Transformation</b></p> <p>The Wallich were successful in being awarded the Council's <i>Housing First</i> Project which commenced at the end of August 2019. A number of milestones have been achieved since then and implementation is progressing well.</p> <p>Recruiting the right support staff is crucial to its success and The Wallich have just completed their recruitment process and are now fully staffed. The project has held its first multi-agency steering group meeting in November, and launch event on 28<sup>th</sup> November which was well supported by a wide number of agencies and services.</p> <p>The Council's Housing Options staff have been working closely with the Housing First (HF) team and 15 entrenched rough sleepers have been identified who the HF team are now actively supporting. As at Monday 6<sup>th</sup> January, 2 rough sleepers were moving into their new homes, and a further 2 had been offered accommodation. Support has commenced with the other 11 rough sleepers. Teams are working with some of the most vulnerable and complex people in the City and each case will bring its different challenges; moving from the streets into accommodation will be a huge step for some and therefore some HF clients will take longer to make that transition.</p> <p>Going forward, the next officer Steering Group is planned for the beginning of February and we are likely see the HF team working with a further 5 rough sleepers over the next couple of months.</p>

	<p>The Housing First project is in addition to provision of wider homelessness prevention services available every night to anyone who may need help, support and accommodation, particularly during the winter months.</p>
	<p><b>Part B – No Supplementaries</b></p>
<p>11.</p>	<p><b>Councillors Mary Jones, Chris Holley &amp; Jeff Jones</b></p> <p>Will the Leader explain why there is a difference in the number of jobs that have been quoted for the new Arena. We have been told in Scrutiny meetings and it was shown in the Cabinet papers on the 21st November 2019 that 620 permanent jobs would be created. In a press release in the local media on the 27th November 2019 a Miss Dixon ATG'S UK venue business manager is quoted as saying "it was an exciting prospect and that more than 100 jobs would be created". On the same page at the bottom another quote saying "it is expected to create 600 long term, full time equivalent jobs."</p> <p><b>Response of the Leader</b></p> <p>The economic impact for the wider Swansea Central Phase 1 project was forecast independently by Amion Consulting. It is important to note that this is for the wider project, not only the Arena component, which I believe is the reason for any difference in figures. The independent 620 FTE jobs forecast has been derived as follows.</p> <p>Amion reviewed the Arena business plan provided by ATG, which suggested that direct on-site employment will amount to 58 FTE jobs. In addition, there would be an estimated £18.57m of off-site visitor expenditure per annum in the economy, supporting the creation of 344 gross FTE jobs. These figures were updated prior to the Cabinet report to accurately reflect the final scheme contents and the actual job numbers, as stated by ATG in their business plan.</p> <p>The hotel would be expected to generate a further 75 FTE jobs on-site, based on employment density benchmarks, and in addition, an estimated £6.26m of off-site visitor expenditure per annum in the local economy, supporting the creation of 116 FTE jobs.</p> <p>Amion also forecast that the retail units, which will host cafes/restaurants, are expected to generate 27.3 FTE jobs on site based on employment density benchmarks.</p> <p>This brings the total gross employment impact from the entire Swansea Central Phase 1 project to some 620 FTE jobs as reported previously to Cabinet.</p> <p>It is also worth remembering that phase one is a public sector intervention to stimulate the economy. Greater job creation and economic impact is expected from phase 2.</p> <p>Many thousands of public and private sector jobs will be created or based in the city centre as part of phase 2, and further details of phase 2 will be released in the coming weeks.</p>

Question 3 Appendix A

Who is using this information?

Here is the complete list of companies who will use your information. Please view their privacy policy for more details.

Reject All

- |   |                          |
|---|--------------------------|
| 1020, Inc. dba Placecast and Ericsson Emodo | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1plusX AG                                   | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2KDirect, Inc. (dba iPromote)               | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 33Across                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7Hops.com Inc. (ZergNet)                    | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| : Tappx                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| A Million Ads Limited                       | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| A.Mob                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| AAX LLC                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Accelerize Inc.                             | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Accorp Sp. z o.o.                           | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Active Agent AG                             | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Acuityads Inc.                              | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Ad Unity Ltd                                | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| ad6media                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Adacado Technologies Inc. (DBA Adacado)     | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| adality GmbH                                | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| ADARA MEDIA UNLIMITED                       | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| AdClear GmbH                                | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| AdColony, Inc.                              | <input type="checkbox"/> |

AddApptr GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdDefend GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdElement Media Solutions Pvt Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adello Group AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adelphic LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adevinta Spain S.L.U.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adform A/S	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adhese	<input type="checkbox"/>
adhood.com	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adikteev / Emoteev	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adimo	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADITION technologies AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adkernel LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adledge	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adloox SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adludio Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADMAN - Phaistos Networks, S.A.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADman Interactive SL	<input type="checkbox"/>
adMarketplace, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdMaxim Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Admedo Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
admetrics GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>

Admixer EU GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Admotion SRL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adnami Aps	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adobe Advertising Cloud	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adobe Audience Manager	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adprime Media Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADRINO Sp. z o.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
adrule mobile GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adserve.zone / Artworx AS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adsolutions BV	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdSpirit GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
adsquare GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adssets AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdsWizz Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adtelligent Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdTheorent, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
AdTiming Technology Company Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADUX	<input type="checkbox"/>
advanced store GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADventori SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adverline	<input type="checkbox"/>
ADWAYS SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>

ADYOULIKE SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Aerserv LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Affectv Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
affilinet	<input type="checkbox"/>
Affle International	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alive & Kicking Global Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alliance Gravity Data Media	<input type="checkbox"/>
Amobee, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
AntVoice	<input type="checkbox"/>
Apester Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
AppConsent Xchange	<input type="checkbox"/>
AppNexus Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Arcspire Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Arkeero	<input type="checkbox"/>
ARMIS SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Arrivalist Co.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ATG Ad Tech Group GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Audience Network	<input type="checkbox"/>
Audience Trading Platform Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
AudienceProject Aps	<input type="checkbox"/>
Audiens S.r.l.	<input type="checkbox"/>
AuDigent	<input type="checkbox"/>



audio content & control GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Automattic Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Avazu Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Avid Media Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Avocet Systems Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Axel Springer Teaser Ad GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Axonix Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Azerion Holding B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
B2B Media Group EMEA GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bandsintown Amplified LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bannerflow AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Beachfront Media LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Beaconspeak Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Beemray Oy	<input type="checkbox"/>
BeeswaxIO Corporation	<input type="checkbox"/>
BEINTOO SPA	<input type="checkbox"/>
BeOp	<input type="checkbox"/>
Better Banners A/S	<input type="checkbox"/>
BidBerry SRL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bidmanagement GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bidstack Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
BIDSWITCH GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>

Bidtellect, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
BidTheatre AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bigabid Media Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
BILENDI SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bit Q Holdings Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
BLIINK SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Blis Media Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Blue	<input type="checkbox"/>
Blue Billywig BV	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bmind a Sales Maker Company, S.L.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bombora Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bounce Exchange, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Brand Metrics Sweden AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Browsi Mobile Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bucksense Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
BusinessClick	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cablato Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Capitaldata	<input type="checkbox"/>
Captify Technologies Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cedato Technologies LTD.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Celtra, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Centro, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>

CerebroAd.com s.r.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ChannelSight	<input type="checkbox"/>
Chargeads	<input type="checkbox"/>
CHEQ AI TECHNOLOGIES LTD.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Clicksco Digital Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Clipcentric, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cloud Technologies S.A.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Codewise Sp. z o.o. Sp. k	<input type="checkbox"/>
Collective Europe Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Collective, Inc. dba Visto	<input type="checkbox"/>
Colpirio.com	<input type="checkbox"/>
Comcast International France SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Commanders Act	<input type="checkbox"/>
communicationAds GmbH & Co. KG	<input type="checkbox"/>
comScore, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Confiant Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Connatix Native Exchange Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ConnectAd Realtime GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Consumable, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact Impact GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Converge-Digital	<input type="checkbox"/>
Conversant Europe Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>

Crimtan Holdings Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Criteo SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cuebiq Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cxense ASA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cybba, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cybersoft	<input type="checkbox"/>
Czech Publisher Exchange z.s.p.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
D-Edge	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dailymotion SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dataseat Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dataxu, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
DeepIntent, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
DEFINE MEDIA GMBH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Delta Projects AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Demandbase, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Densou Trading Desk ApS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dentsu Aegis Network Italia SpA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Digilant Spain, SLU	<input type="checkbox"/>
Digital Control GmbH & Co. KG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Digital East GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
digitalAudience	<input type="checkbox"/>
DIGITEKA Technologies	<input type="checkbox"/>

Digitize New Media Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
DigiTrust / IAB Tech Lab	<input type="checkbox"/>
district m inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
DoubleVerify Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dr. Banner	<input type="checkbox"/>
Drawbridge, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dugout Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
dunnhumby Germany GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Duplo Media AS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Duration Media, LLC.	<input type="checkbox"/>
DynAdmic	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dynamic 1001 GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
EASYmedia GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Effiliation	<input type="checkbox"/>
Effinity	<input type="checkbox"/>
Emerse Sverige AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
emetriq GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
EMX Digital LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Etarget SE	<input type="checkbox"/>
Eulerian Technologies	<input type="checkbox"/>
Exactag GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Exponential Interactive, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>

Eyeota Ptd Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ezoic Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fidelity Media	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fidzup	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fifty Technology Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Flashtalking, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
FlexOffers.com, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Forensiq LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
FORTVISION	<input type="checkbox"/>
Free Stream Media Corp. dba Samba TV	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fusio by S4M	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fyber	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gammed	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gamoshi LTD	<input type="checkbox"/>
GDMServices, Inc. d/b/a FiksuDSP	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gemius SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Genius Sports Media Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Getintent USA, inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
GlobalWebIndex	<input type="checkbox"/>
Go.pl sp. z o.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Goldbach Group AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Golden Bees	<input type="checkbox"/>

Goodway Group, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
GP One GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
GRAPHINIUM	<input type="checkbox"/>
Greenhouse Group BV (with its trademark LemonPI)	<input type="checkbox"/>
GroupM UK Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
GumGum, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Haensel AMS GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Happydemics	<input type="checkbox"/>
hbfsTech	<input type="checkbox"/>
HIRO Media Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Hivestack Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Hottraffic BV (DMA Institute)	<input type="checkbox"/>
Hybrid Adtech GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
ID5 Technology SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
IgnitionAi Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
IgnitionOne	<input type="checkbox"/>
Illuma Technology Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Impactify	<input type="checkbox"/>
Impression Desk Technologies Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Improve Digital International BV	<input type="checkbox"/>
Index Exchange, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
INFINIA MOBILE S.L.	<input type="checkbox"/>

InMobi Pte Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
INNITY	<input type="checkbox"/>
Innovid Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Inskin Media LTD	<input type="checkbox"/>
Inspired Mobile Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Instinctive, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Instreamatic inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
InsurAds Technologies SA.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Integral Ad Science, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intent Media, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intercept Interactive Inc. dba Undertone	<input type="checkbox"/>
Internet BillBoard a.s.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intowow Innovation Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
INVIBES GROUP	<input type="checkbox"/>
iotec global Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
IPONWEB GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Jaduda GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Jampp LTD	<input type="checkbox"/>
Jivox Corporation	<input type="checkbox"/>
Join	<input type="checkbox"/>
Jointag S.r.l.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Justpremium BV	<input type="checkbox"/>



Kairos Fire	<input type="checkbox"/>
Kayzen	<input type="checkbox"/>
Keymantics	<input type="checkbox"/>
Knorex Pte Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Kochava Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
KUPONA GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Kwanko	<input type="checkbox"/>
LBC France	<input type="checkbox"/>
Leadplace - Temelio	<input type="checkbox"/>
LeftsnRight, Inc. dba LIQWID	<input type="checkbox"/>
Leiki Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
LEMO MEDIA GROUP LIMITED	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lifesight Pte. Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
LifeStreet Corporation	<input type="checkbox"/>
Liftoff Mobile, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ligatus GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Linicom	<input type="checkbox"/>
LiquidM Technology GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Little Big Data sp.z.o.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Liveintent Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
LiveRamp, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
LKQD, a division of Nexstar Digital, LLC.	<input type="checkbox"/>

Localsensor B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Location Sciences AI Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
LoopMe Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
LotaData, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lotame Solutions, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lucid Holdings, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
M32 Connect Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Madington	<input type="checkbox"/>
Madison Logic, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
MADVERTISE MEDIA	<input type="checkbox"/>
mainADV Srl	<input type="checkbox"/>
MAIRDUMONT NETLETIX GmbH&Co. KG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Marfeel Solutions S.L	<input type="checkbox"/>
Market Resource Partners LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Maximus Live LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Maytrics GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
mbr targeting GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
McCann Discipline LTD	<input type="checkbox"/>
Media.net Advertising FZ-LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mediaforce LTD	<input type="checkbox"/>
MediaMath, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
mediarithmics SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>

Mediasmart Mobile S.L.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Meetrics GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
MGID Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mindlytix SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
MiQ	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mirando GmbH & Co KG	<input type="checkbox"/>
MISSENA	<input type="checkbox"/>
mobalo GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mobfox US LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mobile Journey B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mobile Professionals BV	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mobilewalla, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mobsuccess	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mobusi Mobile Advertising S.L.	<input type="checkbox"/>
My6sense Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Myntelligence Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
MyTraffic	<input type="checkbox"/>
N Technologies Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Nano Interactive GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Nativo, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Near Pte Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Neodata Group srl	<input type="checkbox"/>

NEORY GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Netsprint SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
NetSuccess, s.r.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
netzeffekt GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
NEURAL.ONE	<input type="checkbox"/>
Neustar on behalf of The Procter & Gamble Company	<input type="checkbox"/>
Neustar, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
News and Media Holding, a.s.	<input type="checkbox"/>
NEXD	<input type="checkbox"/>
NextRoll, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Nielsen Marketing Cloud	<input type="checkbox"/>
Norstat Danmark A/S	<input type="checkbox"/>
Noster Finance S.L.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Notify	<input type="checkbox"/>
nugg.ad GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
numberly	<input type="checkbox"/>
Oath (EMEA) Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ogury Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
On Device Research Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
OnAudience Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
OneTag Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Onfocus (Adagio)	<input type="checkbox"/>

Online Advertising Network Sp. z o.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Online Solution Int Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Onnetwork Sp. z o.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ooyala Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
OpenX	<input type="checkbox"/>
Opinary GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Optomaton UG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Oracle	<input type="checkbox"/>
Oracle AddThis	<input type="checkbox"/>
Orion Semantics	<input type="checkbox"/>
ORTEC B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Otto (GmbH & Co KG)	<input type="checkbox"/>
Outbrain UK Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
PaperG, Inc. dba Thunder Industries	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parsec Media Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Passendo ApS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Perform Media Services Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Permodo GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Permutive Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Permutive Technologies, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Pexi B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
pilotx.tv	<input type="checkbox"/>

Pixalate, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
PIXIMEDIA SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Platform161	<input type="checkbox"/>
Playbuzz Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
PLAYGROUND XYZ EMEA LTD	<input type="checkbox"/>
plista GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Pocketmath Pte Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Polar Mobile Group Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
PowerLinks Media Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Predicio	<input type="checkbox"/>
PREX Programmatic Exchange GmbH&Co KG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programatica de publicidad S.L.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Proxi.cloud Sp. z o.o.	<input type="checkbox"/>
PROXISTORE	<input type="checkbox"/>
PUB OCEAN LIMITED	<input type="checkbox"/>
Publicis Media GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Publishers Internationale Pty Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
PubMatic, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
PubNative GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
PulsePoint, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Purch Group, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
PurposeLab, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>

Qriously	<input type="checkbox"/>
Quantcast International Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Qwertize	<input type="checkbox"/>
R-Advertising	<input type="checkbox"/>
R-TARGET	<input type="checkbox"/>
Radio Net Media Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Rakuten Marketing LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Readpeak Oy	<input type="checkbox"/>
Realeyes OÜ	<input type="checkbox"/>
realzeit GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
ReigNN Platform Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Relay42 Netherlands B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
remerge GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Research and Analysis of Media in Sweden AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Research Now Group, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Revcontent, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Reveal Mobile, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
RevLifter Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Rezonce Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
RhythmOne, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Rich Audience	<input type="checkbox"/>
RMSi Radio Marketing Service interactive GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>

Rockabox Media Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Rockerbox, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
RockYou, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Roq.ad GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
RTB House S.A.	<input type="checkbox"/>
RTK.IO, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
RUN, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
salesforce.com, inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Samba TV UK Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sanoma Media Finland	<input type="checkbox"/>
Scene Stealer Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Schibsted Norge AS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Schibsted Product and Tech UK	<input type="checkbox"/>
Seeding Alliance GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Seedtag Advertising S.L	<input type="checkbox"/>
Seenthis AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sellpoints Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Semasio GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Seznam.cz, a.s.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ShareThis, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sharethrough, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
SheMedia, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>



Shopalyst Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Shopstyle	<input type="checkbox"/>
ShowHeroes GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sift Media, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Signal Digital Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Signals	<input type="checkbox"/>
Simplifi Holdings Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
SINGLESPOT SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sirdata	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sizmek	<input type="checkbox"/>
Skaze	<input type="checkbox"/>
Skimbit Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
SlimCut Media SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smaato, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smadex SL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smart Adserver	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smart Traffik	<input type="checkbox"/>
smartclip Europe GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smartclip Hispania SL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smartme Analytics	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smartology Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
SMARTSTREAM.TV GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>

SmartyAds Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Smile Wanted Group	<input type="checkbox"/>
Snapsort Inc., operating as Sortable	<input type="checkbox"/>
Snapupp Technologies SL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Social Tokens Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sojern, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Solocal	<input type="checkbox"/>
Somo Audience Corp	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sonobi, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Soundcast	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sourcepoint Technologies, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sovrn Holdings Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Spolecznosci Sp. z o.o. Sp. k.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sportradar AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Spot.IM Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Spotad	<input type="checkbox"/>
SpotX	<input type="checkbox"/>
SpringServe, LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
StackAdapt	<input type="checkbox"/>
StartApp Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Steel House, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ströer Mobile Performance GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>

Ströer SSP GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sub2 Technologies Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sublime	<input type="checkbox"/>
SunMedia	<input type="checkbox"/>
Switch Concepts Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
SYNC	<input type="checkbox"/>
TabMo SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Taboola Europe Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
TACTIC™ Real-Time Marketing AS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Tapad, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Tapjoy, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
TAPTAP Networks SL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Targetspot Belgium SPRL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Teads	<input type="checkbox"/>
Tealium Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Teemo SA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Telaria, Inc	<input type="checkbox"/>
Telecoming S.A.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Telefonica Investigación y Desarrollo S.A.U	<input type="checkbox"/>
Teroa S.A.	<input type="checkbox"/>
The ADEX GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
The Kantar Group Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>

The MediaGrid Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
The Ozone Project Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
The Reach Group GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
The Rubicon Project, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
The Trade Desk	<input type="checkbox"/>
Think Clever Media	<input type="checkbox"/>
Thirdpresence Oy	<input type="checkbox"/>
Timehop, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
TimeOne	<input type="checkbox"/>
Totaljobs Group Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
Tradedoubler AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Tradelab, SAS	<input type="checkbox"/>
TradeTracker	<input type="checkbox"/>
travel audience GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
TreSensa, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Triapodi Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Triboo Data Analytics	<input type="checkbox"/>
TripleLift, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Triton Digital Canada Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
TrueData Solutions, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
TTNET AS	<input type="checkbox"/>
Tunni BV	<input type="checkbox"/>

Turbo	<input type="checkbox"/>
twiago GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
UberMedia, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
ucfunnel Co., Ltd.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Underdog Media LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
Unruly Group Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
uppr GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Uprival LLC	<input type="checkbox"/>
usemax advertisement (Emego GmbH)	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vdopia DBA Chocolate Platform	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ve Global	<input type="checkbox"/>
VECTAURY	<input type="checkbox"/>
Venatus Media Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vibrant Media Limited	<input type="checkbox"/>
video intelligence AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Video Media Groep B.V.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Video Reach	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vidoomy Media SL	<input type="checkbox"/>
ViewPay	<input type="checkbox"/>
Viralize SRL	<input type="checkbox"/>
Visarity Technologies GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
VRTCAL Markets, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>

Vuble	<input type="checkbox"/>
WebAds B.V	<input type="checkbox"/>
Webedia	<input type="checkbox"/>
WebMediaRM	<input type="checkbox"/>
WEBORAMA	<input type="checkbox"/>
Welect GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
WhatRocks Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Whenever Media Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
White Ops, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Widespace AB	<input type="checkbox"/>
Wizaly	<input type="checkbox"/>
X-Mode Social, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
xAd, Inc. dba GroundTruth	<input type="checkbox"/>
YellowHammer Media Group	<input type="checkbox"/>
Yieldlab AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Yieldlove GmbH	<input type="checkbox"/>
Yieldmo, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Yieldr UK	<input type="checkbox"/>
YOC AG	<input type="checkbox"/>
Yormedia Solutions Ltd	<input type="checkbox"/>
ZBO Media	<input type="checkbox"/>
Zemanta, Inc.	<input type="checkbox"/>

zeotap GmbH



Zeta Global



Ziff Davis LLC



ZighZag